

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

“A library is not simply a repository of books, it is the symbol and center of our culture ... a door and a window for those who might not otherwise have such doors and windows.” Amy Tan, author¹

This study of the total public library needs of Louisville was initiated with the release of the Request For Proposal. The Louisville Free Public Library (LFPL) was seeking to develop a *Master Facilities Plan* designed to enhance public library service throughout all of Louisville.

The recommendations of the *Plan* will assist the Library in meeting the challenge of how to best serve the residents of Louisville. It provides a framework for the Library to develop a program of service tailored to meet specific library services and facility needs.

The Kentucky Department of Libraries and Archives has published *Minimum Standards for Public Library Adequacy*. The standards reveal that Louisville is quite deficient in two of the major categories -- books per capita and building square footage per capita. It is most important that these deficiencies be corrected as failure to do so would seriously hamper the Library's ability to secure state construction funds. The users of the Library will be the primary beneficiaries of the improvements via larger collections, additional space for technology, programming, and the like.

The consultants, PROVIDENCE Associates Inc, were charged with the following study specifics:

- Describe in detail the facilities development alternatives that will support the service goals, meet Commonwealth standards, and provide for growth for the next 20 years in the branch libraries and the Main Library
- Involve the public in evaluating the alternatives, including a branch and Main Library charettes
- Develop a comparative report of public library capital development programs in a peer group of cities in the country

¹ *footnotes*, the newsletter of the Friends of the Park Forest Public Library, Summer 2002.

- Develop a formal *Master Facilities Plan* for adoption by the Library Advisory Commission, a plan that guides the development of facilities and informs the public, elected officials, library supporters, and the staff

PLANNING LIBRARY FACILITIES TODAY

Public library facilities are opportunities for communities to aspire to the highest levels of service. They need to express dignity, permanence, and civic pride. They are gathering places built not only for functionality, but also to delight and to bring a higher sense of purpose.

Louisville should expect its libraries of the future to create a sense of rejuvenation, a sense of pride, and a sense of ownership. The projects recommended in this *Plan* should result in new public library buildings that aspire to become much more than what the community has settled for over the past few years. The new libraries can provide a perfect juxtaposition to capture the hearts and minds of people and to provide the enchantment essential to a city that is on the brink of greatness. The LFPL can become the soul of the city if given the support it needs that is so long overdue.

The new library facilities – be they branch libraries, regional libraries, or a Main Library – must be aesthetically pleasing and enhance the environment of Greater Louisville.

LOUISVILLE AND ITS PEERS

Building Projects

Many public libraries across the United States experienced a “building boom” in the 1990s, building new central (or main) and branch libraries and renovating and expanding existing facilities.

Among the 16 libraries there have been 96 branch library projects completed or underway. There have also been six central, or main, library projects completed, including three all-new facilities. Four other main library buildings are now under construction or in planning. The largest of the all-new central library projects were in Memphis and Nashville where the new facilities were 330,000 square feet (SF) and 300,000 SF respectively.

Comparative Rankings

With assistance from the staff of the LFPL and using the latest edition of *Public Library Data Service*² the consultants compared and ranked Louisville with 15 other locales. Louisville ranks quite low, and in more than a few instances the lowest, among the peer group. For instance, Louisville ranks in the lowest quartile in seven of the 14 measurable categories. Louisville is last -- 16th out of 16 -- in three of the categories:

- Total Branch Library Square Feet Per Capita
- Library Materials Per Capita
- Population Served Per FTE Librarian

Louisville is next to last in two additional categories:

- Total Library Size (Square Feet) Per Capita
- Per Capita Library Income.

THE COMMUNITY SPEAKS

Over the course of the study the Greater Louisville community was presented with several opportunities to share their thoughts and ideas regarding the LFPL and its future. Twenty-nine focus group discussions were held with 396 public and 68 staff participants. A “web” survey was administered with over 400 persons responding. Approximately 200 persons attended six Town Hall meetings to discuss the preliminary report. Prior to the library consultants work on the project there was a telephone survey conducted by the University of Louisville Urban Studies Institute that reached 410 persons.

The community, based upon the input of over 1,200 persons, is enthusiastic about the Library and the progress made the past few years in terms of additional computers, programs, and exhibits. They also recognize the inadequacy of many of the current facilities, the shortage of books and other forms of media, and the lack of enough staff to provide all of the requested services.

According to the telephone survey administered last year by the University of Louisville 96 percent of those participating said the Library was very important to the community. The Library outranked all other services included in the survey.

KEY LEADER INTERVIEWS

The principal consultant for the Master Plan study met with and interviewed 19 persons from throughout Louisville; persons identified as key leaders in the community.

² *PUBLIC LIBRARY DATA SERVICE: Statistical Report 2002*. Chicago, Public Library Association, 2002.

The key leaders identified three primary issues: technology, funding, and governance and community involvement. In addition, three more frequently mentioned priorities included service for children, accessibility, and programming and exhibits. "The Library offers a great opportunity to lift up different aspects of culture. There is a need for both the dollars and the resources to make this happen."³

In many ways the public library is as important as K-12, but people need to be made aware of its importance. Louisville either has to spend to educate and inform, or re-prioritize. A case must be made. "The demographics of the neighborhoods need to be understood, the best possible job with present funding needs to be demonstrated."⁴

In the words of one of the key leaders: "Improvements should be viewed and approached as meeting a long-term need, as an investment in the community, as an investment in the children of Louisville."⁵

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Branch Libraries

First, it is important to point out that the collections are being used, more and more each year. Between 1999 and 2002 the branch library circulation increased over 201,000 -- a percentage gain of 7.2 percent over the four year period. Other usage indicators include over the same span of time include:

- Door count - a gain of just under eight percent, to a total of 2.36 million
- Information requests – a rise of 27.9 percent, total of near one million.

This very healthy increase in usage underscores the importance of the Library throughout Greater Louisville and the need for improvements to meet the standards.

The consultants are recommending that the greater Louisville area be organized into six geographic clusters for library planning purposes. These six areas are estimated to have a population in 2007 of 642,742. This is a slight increase over 2002 of .07 percent.

The proposed clusters and existing libraries within each are as follows:

- Eastern - Jeffersontown, Middletown, and Westport
- Northeastern - Bon Air, Crescent Hill, Highlands-Shelby Park, and St. Matthews-Eline
- Northwestern - Portland, Shawnee, and Western
- Southeastern - Fern Creek and Okolona
- Southwestern - Fairdale and Southwest
- West Central - Iroquois and Shively-Newman.

³ Richmond, Benjamin K. President and CEO, Louisville Urban League.

⁴ Newman, Brian K. Fern Creek Chamber of Commerce and Business Association.

⁵ Meyer, Polly L. Administrator, South Jefferson Neighborhood Place.

Two options were developed. Each option will result in the LFPL having a total of 19 branch libraries. There will be, depending upon which option is implemented:

Option 1 - 19 projects the following projects have been recommended:

- Regional libraries, three all-new facilities
- Branch libraries, two all new facilities (Newburg and Southwest Community)
- Branch libraries, seven replacement facilities (Fairdale, Fern Creek, Highlands-Shelby Park, Middletown, St. Matthews-Eline, Shawnee, and Shively-Newman)
- Branch libraries, seven renovation/expansion buildings, Bon Air, Crescent Hill, Iroquois, Jeffersontown, Okolona, Portland, and Western.

Option 2 - 19 projects the following projects have been recommended:

- Regional libraries, three all-new facilities
- Branch libraries, two all new facilities (Newburg and Southwest Community)
- Branch libraries, five replacement facilities (Fairdale, Fern Creek, Middletown, St. Matthews-Eline, and Shively-Newman)
- Branch libraries, eight renovation/expansion buildings, Bon Air, Crescent Hill, Iroquois, Jeffersontown, Okolona, Portland, Shawnee, and Western
- Branch library, continuation of leased space with modest expansion, Highlands-Shelby Park.

Whichever option is implemented the residents of Greater Louisville will realize major programmatic and service improvements in their branch libraries:

<i>Programmatic/Service Element</i>	<i>Current Conditions</i>	<i>Option 1</i>	<i>Option 2</i>
Collections	785,209	1,338,900	1,344,650
Periodical Subscriptions	1,802	2,390	2,405
Customer Seats	946	1,498	1,503
Meeting Room Seats	1,302	2,208	2,249

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Main Library

There were three options prepared for the Main Library as follows.

Option 1 would result in a total size of 254,100 SF, which is approximately 43,000 SF less than the projected 20-year needs. The 87,000 SF of additional space is achieved as follows:

- New Auditorium and Lobby on the first level
- New third floor on the North Building (1969 design allowed for a one-level expansion)

- Capturing the perimeter space on the main level of the North Building by pushing the glass line to the edge of the structure.

The primary reason for the space shortfall in this option is that it removes the central core of stacks in the South Building, and there is not sufficient land on the site to expand horizontally more than the charette scheme indicates.

Option 2 would result in a total of 314,815 SF, which is about 18,000 SF larger than the projected needs. This option endeavors to make better use of the South Building from a service and staff efficiency standpoint, which results in there being some space that has no logical use at this time. In addition, the central core stack space is replaced in the new North Building.

Option 3, an all-new facility, is the amount of square footage identified as meeting the 20-year needs of a Main Library for Greater Louisville, 297,430 SF. During the charette process the consultants demonstrated that a new building could be located at the intersection of Third Street and Broadway provided the North Building was demolished. The South Building would remain and its usage would be for non-Library functions.

The LFPL may want to entertain opportunities for partnering with others with regard to Option 3.

If Option 3 is implemented the residents of Greater Louisville will realize the following major programmatic and service improvements in the Main Library.

<i>Programmatic/Service Element</i>	<i>Current Conditions</i>	<i>Option 3</i>
Collections	336,374	563,000
Periodical Subscriptions	875	1,828
Customer Seats	308	440
Meeting Room Seats	130	1,020

Meeting Commonwealth Requirements

Do the combination of options meet Commonwealth requirements? The numbers on the following page indicates that any combination of options will not only meet the standards based upon the estimated Greater Louisville population in 2007, but will also meet the standards for the projected 2022 population of 724,445.

	<i>Space</i>	<i>Collections</i>
Branch Libraries Option 1 =	362,350	1,514,900
Main Library Option 1 =	<u>254,100</u>	<u>463,000</u>
Totals	616,450	1,977,900
2007 Estimated Population	703,055	
Space Per Capita	0.88	
Collections Per Capita		2.81
2022 Estimated Population	724,445	
Space Per Capita	0.85	
Collections Per Capita		2.73

	<i>Space</i>	<i>Collections</i>
Branch Libraries Option 2	366,740	1,520,650
Main Library Option 2 =	<u>314,815</u>	<u>563,000</u>
Totals	681,555	2,083,650
2007 Estimated Population	703,055	
Space Per Capita	0.97	
Collections Per Capita		2.96
2022 Estimated Population	724,445	
Space Per Capita	0.94	
Collections Per Capita		2.88

	<i>Space</i>	<i>Collections</i>
Branch Libraries Option 1 =	362,350	1,514,900
Main Library Option 3 =	<u>297,430</u>	<u>563,000</u>
Totals	659,780	2,077,900
2007 Estimated Population	703,055	
Space Per Capita	0.94	
Collections Per Capita		2.95
2022 Estimated Population	724,455	
Space Per Capita	0.91	
Collections Per Capita		2.87

The Commonwealth requirements state that the LFPL must have the following or risk losing eligibility for state construction funds:

- Space per capita - 0.60
- Collections per capita - 2.50.

Library Locations

This *Plan* was not charged with the responsibility of recommending locations for the facilities beyond the broad geographic areas already discussed, e.g. “Eastern” Regional Library, “Southwest Community” Branch Library, etc. Neither

were we expected to suggest a downtown location for an all-new Main Library should that be the direction Louisville moves.

The consultants do believe – with regard to the Main Library – that it should be in downtown Louisville. The master plan designed to guide development of downtown Louisville includes as one of nine “development principles” the reinforcement of “...downtown as the unique cultural, business, entertainment, retail and civic center of the region.”⁶ Certainly a Main Library is a critical component of such a goal.

CAPITAL COST ESTIMATES

The Branch Libraries

Option 1 - The estimated capital costs for the 19 projects is \$71,540,770. The LFPL would save an estimated \$7,200,000 in lease payments with this option (current lease costs are \$360,000 per year, times 20 years).

By factoring in the lease savings the total capital cost of Option 1 is estimated to be \$64,340,770. On a per capita basis, calculated on the 2007 estimated population, the cost would be \$4.57 for 20 years.

Option 2 - The estimated capital costs for the 19 projects is \$71,719,900. The Library would also save a considerable amount of money on lease payments with this option, an estimated \$5,660,000 over 20 years.

Approaching the Option 2 total costs as done for Option 1, the estimated total is \$66,108,570. This produces a per capita cost for 20 years of \$4.70.

The Main Library

For the three Main Library options:

- Option 1 - \$64,593,680 for 254,100 SF.

This is the least costly of the three options because it provides the smallest amount of space.

- Option 2 - \$116,019,250 for 314,815 SF.

This is the most costly of the three options for the following reasons:

- Demolition of the existing North Building
- Need to do additional footings and foundation work to protect the South Building

⁶ Shafer, Sheldon S. “Master plan outlines downtown’s future.” *The Courier-Journal*, September 12, 2002, p.B1.

- New construction to be much more sympathetic to the South Building than the 1969 addition.
- Option 3 - \$71,368,720 for 297,430 SF.

This option does not include demolition of the North Building should this option be selected and the Broadway/Third Street intersection be the site for the new facility.

Elements of the Construction Cost Estimates

The cost estimates are in current year dollars, and include the following cost elements:

- Construction
- Furniture and equipment
- Design fees
- Information technology
- Construction contingency
- Contractor's overhead and profit
- Owner's cost (testing, permits, legal expenses, consultation, and project management)
- Owner's contingency.

Additional Capital Costs

In addition to the cost of the buildings, the consultants recommend the following additional capital costs for the total Master Facilities Plan:

- Opening day collections - 400,000 items at a cost of \$8,000,000
- Sites for branch libraries - \$6,500,000.

Total Estimated Capital Costs

If the least costly combination of branch library and Main Library options are considered, along with the collection and site costs, the total would be as follows:

- Total cost - \$143,434,450
- Cost per resident, 2007 population estimate - \$204.02
- Cost per resident for 20-year period - \$10.20.

Looking at the other extreme, the most costly combination of branch library and Main Library options are considered, along with the collection and site costs, the total would be as follows:

- Total cost - \$196,627,820
- Cost per resident, 2007 population estimate - \$279.67
- Cost per resident for 20-year period - \$13.98.

Annual Operational Costs

For library collections the operating cost estimates are based upon the following assumptions:

- Average cost of new acquisitions will be \$20.00 per year, subject to annual increase of 3.5 percent
- Annual budget for library materials will increase five percent beginning in 2004
- Collection management will retire five percent of the holdings each year
- Capital improvements program will result in addition of 40,000 items per year for a 10-year period starting in 2004
- Gifts and donations will allow addition of about 6,635 items per year
- Budget for library materials targeted to meet 20-year facility capacity projections.

For periodical subscriptions:

- Average cost of subscriptions will be \$91.40 per year, subject to annual increase of 7.5 percent
- Annual budget for subscriptions will increase nine percent beginning in 2004
- Budget for library materials targeted to meet 20-year facility capacity projections.

For personnel the consultants computed the estimated costs as follows:

- Salary adjustments of \$200,000 per year for a three-year period, 2004 - 2006, to improve the LFPL's competitive position
- All new positions needed as a result of the capital improvements program to be employed by 2013
- Annual escalation in personnel costs at 3.5 percent.

The total budget for personnel will increase to \$26,654,074 by 2022.

For all other costs the consultants used the figures developed in the Carpenter, Mountjoy & Bressler study with projected costs forward to 2022 at an annual rate of increase of 1.5 percent beyond 2012.

Looking ahead over the next 20 years the annual operating budget necessary to fully implement the facility recommendations and meet the standards of the State of Kentucky will be as follows:

<i>Year</i>	<i>Estimated Total</i>	<i>Estimated Per Capita</i>
2003	\$16,906,100	\$24.29
2008	\$28,378,486	\$40.28
2013	\$34,850,623	\$48.58
2018	\$40,725,395	\$56.67
2022	\$46,295,098	\$63.90